

Weaknesses in textile globalization processes and their relation to CSR through a DELPHI analysis: ethics or aesthetics

Debilidades dentro de los procesos de mundialización textil y relación con la RSE a través de un análisis DELPHI: ética o estética

ARTURO LUQUE GONZÁLEZ*, JUAN HERNÁNDEZ ZUBIZARRETA**,
CARMEN DE PABLOS HEREDERO*

*UNIVERSIDAD REY JUAN CARLOS, **UNIVERSIDAD DEL PAÍS VASCO

Artículo recibido: 19 diciembre 2016
Solicitud de revisión: 01 febrero 2016
Artículo aceptado: 28 julio 2016

Abstract

The objective of this research is to identify the main weaknesses of corporate social responsibility in the textile sector and to propose procedures that help to overcome them. We start from the assumption that the asymmetries and necessary relationships generated to manufacture textile garments in the international context are not attributable to a single circumstance. Equally, it is reasonable to assume that the solutions to these asymmetries are affected by the identification and transversality of such circumstances. The present research was carried out by gathering the opinions and solutions of participants in a Delphi analysis to uncover the critical points and vulnerabilities of the sector. The weaknesses of the sector were then identified following the analysis of responses from two expert panels to two multidisciplinary questionnaires, the questions for which were developed from the stated hypotheses.

Keywords: globalization, corporate social responsibility, transnational corporations, corruption, legislation

Resumen

El objetivo de esta investigación es detectar las principales debilidades del sector textil en relación con la responsabilidad social empresarial y proponer medidas que contribuyan a superarlas. Partimos de que las asimetrías y relaciones generadas necesarias para fabricar prendas textiles en el contexto internacional no son imputables a una sola circunstancia. Es igualmente entendible que sus soluciones pasen por la identificación y la transversalidad de dichas circunstancias. En la presente investigación, lo llevamos a cabo mediante la recolección de opiniones y soluciones expresadas por diferentes participantes, y a través

de un análisis Delphi, para conocer cuáles son los puntos críticos y vulnerabilidades del sector, y la posterior identificación de sus debilidades tras el análisis de las respuestas de dos paneles de expertos a dos cuestionarios multidisciplinares con preguntas desarrolladas sobre las hipótesis planteadas.

Palabras clave: globalización, responsabilidad social corporativa, empresas transnacionales, corrupción, legislación

PARTICIPANTS

This research project would have not been possible without the participation of experts who took part in an altruistic and disinterested way. 450 pages of both quantitative and qualitative answers were received from the participants for academic discussion. Amongst others we would like to mention Fernando Oliván (Director of the Euromediterranean observatory, ex-member of The International Criminal Court (ICC) and professor at King Juan Carlos University and Sorbonne University), Isidor Boix (secretary for International Trading Action FITEQA-CC.OO), Octavio Granado (expert in public financing and ex-secretary of State for Social Security), Michael Addo (researcher at the University of Exeter, Devon, UK, and member of a UN working group on Business and Human Rights), Gabriel Flores Sánchez (researcher from the Complutense Institute of International Studies), Aleida Hernández (researcher at the National Autonomous University in Mexico), Juan Andrés Cano (CEO of Value4Chain), María del Mar Maira Vidal (researcher at Valladolid University), Rodrigo Martín (researcher at URJC, ex-magistrate of the TSJM and member of the academic council in Gómez-Acebo & Pombo), Alejandro Goldberg (researcher at CONICET), Amaya Apesteguía (OCU), Ibon Maza (BabyAuto), Enrique Dussel (researcher at the Autonomous University of Mexico and coordinator of studies in CEPAL and OIT), Jesús García Luengos (Coordinator for the RESET Research on Security and Transnational Governance think tank), Jordi Bonet (Professor of Public International Rights at the University of Barcelona), José Manuel Pureza (researcher at Coimbra University, and CES, UN, and CPA arbiter on sea issues), Roberto Toscano (researcher in international relationships and SCR, in addition to being Italy's ex-ambassador in Iran and India), Juan Manzanedo (CEO of LOGISFASHION), Juan Pérez Ventura (CEO of the World Order in the XXI century), Paula Alves (employee of the Inditex group for 24 years and secretary of the Textile-Leather Industry FITAG-UGT), Santi Mallorquí (CEO of OR-

GANIC COTTON COLOURS), Martim Gemzell (WARONTWANT), Gema Gómez (CEO of SLOW FASHION SPAIN), Carmen Gómez-Cotta (ETHIC), Enrique Palazuelos Manso (Full time professor in Applied Economy at the Complutense University in Madrid), Michael Tamvakis (researcher at Cass Business School), Eva García (ECOLOGY), Alejandro Dulitzky (researcher at San Martín National University), Juan Torres (Full time professor of Applied Economy at Seville University and member of the ATTAC Scientific Committee), Amparo Merino Segovia (researcher at Castilla la Mancha University), Gonzalo Berrón (FES Fundación Friedrich Ebert), Alejandro Teitelbaum (writer, lawyer and representative of the International Federation for Human Rights and the American Association of jurists to the United Nations), Carmen Silla (JEANOLOGIA), Antonio Baylos (Full time professor in Work and Social Security Law at Castilla la Mancha University), Álvaro Orsatti (CSA), Monika Kemperle (IndustriALL Global Union), Mariano Aguirre (director of the Norwegian Peacebuilding Resource Centre NOREF in Oslo), Pablo José Martínez Osés (researcher and coordinator of the state campaign Zero Poverty and member of 2015ymas), Iñaki Barcena (Full time professor of Political Sciences at the Basque Country University), Virginia Rondeel (BCN Sustainable Fashion), Marta Castells (CITYC), Enrique Guerrero Salom (lecturer and eurodeputy), Javier Chércoles (researcher at Dhaka University and director of risks in Associated British Foods plc), Esteban Kaipl (researcher at Litoral University), Iratxe Arteagoitia & Eva Kreisler (SETEM & CLEAN CLOTHES CAMPAIGN), José Miguel Mulet (researcher at the Molecular and Cellular Plants Institute IBMCP, Valencia), Amanda Cattermole (CATTERMOLECONSULTING), Liliane Spenderler (FRIENDSOFLAND), Cheryl S. Watson (researcher at the University of Texas Medical Branch), Isabel Soriano (AITEEX), Dolores Romano (independent researcher/Ecologists in action), Antonio Solé Cabanes (ASOLEGIN), Oscar Miralles (independent researcher), Xavier Giménez Font (researcher in Environmental Chemistry at Barcelona University), Raimon Guitart (researcher in toxicology at the Autonomous University in Barcelona), Ferran Ballester (coordinator of Health and the Environment at the Upper Centre for Research in Public Health, CSISP), Stephane Horel (independent researcher) and Carlos de Prada (Fodesam).

1. INTRODUCTION

The present textile industry model is based on the production and analysis of information from a range of channels –many of them in real time– owned by transnational textile corporations and their subsidiaries, suppliers, outsourced companies, and so on (Buxmann, 1999, Gil et al., 2008). Relationships are currently established with thousands of suppliers –with the capacity to bring these to the markets– taking advantage of an efficient response (Guercini and Runfola, 2004). The risks of setting up a specific business in a given country (Echezarraga and Jarillo, 2001: 129) must be considered, as well as the study of the conditions of entry for products from third countries, and the determination of compliance with the legal and regulatory framework of the European Union (Jódar, 1998: 14). Growth of global competition, the appearance of new risks, society's demands, and the emergence of inherent attitudes to textile manufacturing, such as those noted by Heuskel and Costa (1999: 36), have forced internal suppliers to compete aggressively in an open market to secure their next order. There is therefore a need to explore the objectives of this study in depth, namely, to gauge lack of awareness in many companies and governments of the continuous and systematic non-compliance with labor regulations, despite the recommendations of recognized institutions such as the International Labor Organization (ILO), as well as the effect on human rights (HR) and ethics, due to the surge of economic systems based on unlimited growth and the analysis of new production methods and ultra-fast business management systems. The representative interviewed from Value4Chain made the following comment:¹

Perhaps we will see more innovation in developing countries that can use new technologies to compete with traditional models. This could change the scenario of value chains, where value added is captured in the brand, in the marketing, and not so much in production, which is where more people are affected (2015).

Many variables must be analyzed to know how this sector works. These include identifying the competences essential to companies' activities (Prahalad and Hamel, 1990), or the environment and tools available to

1 J.A Cano (Value4Chain), R.Toscano, J. Chércoles, C. S. Watson (July 2015). Author's own documentation extracted from a Delphi analysis/interview with the authors by (A. Luque, interviewer) and included in the thesis «Management and control of the value chain within the textile sector in developing countries, towards the limits of logistics and outsourcing: ethics or aesthetics».

them, supported in turn by the technological evolution of productivity systems managed through new business organization models (Hess and Yeung 2006; Christopher et al., 2006). Other variables such as corruption processes are less organizational –although not less institutionalized– examples of which are legalized corruption, systemic corruption, meta-corruption, endogenous corruption, nepotism, «tailor-made» regulation so that the rest of activities are unregulated *ad hoc* and «play the game» in the space where the state legislates by not legislating (Sánchez Barrilao, 2004), and all type of private interests with the capacity to affect. According to Ziegler, UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food between 2000 and 2008, in Bangladesh «there is no hygiene regulation, no wage law. Unions are banned. Recruitment and dismissal are made on the basis of fluctuations of orders from New York, London, Hong Kong or Paris»² (2013: 207).

According to Kahhat (2005) and The Globe and Mail (2005), corruption is now seen as one of the main causes of underdevelopment. Toscano¹ (2015) states that, «as repeated cases have revealed, especially in Bangladesh, labor, social and environmental and safety regulation abuses continue despite the regulations in force, due to high levels of corruption». These situations have led to dilemmas such as companies assuming a certain degree of responsibility but its members –from workers to plenipotentiary executives– do not, thereby expediting both individual and corporate moral deterioration. «More than anything else, greed and corruption are responsible for a huge eight-story textile factory where nearly four thousand people work, like many others around the world» (Rendueles and Marlasca, 2013).

The questions this situation poses, and demand a response, are therefore: Where have we come from and where are we going? What do we want for our companies and societies? As Chércoles² points out (2015) «fighting corruption should be part of any strategy of CSR that is considered sustainable».

It is therefore necessary to go deeper into the concept of corporate social responsibility, CSR, starting from its social nature. CSR is adopted by the company as a response to society, and CSR goes beyond the law, although it should neither be a substitute for nor distort it. CSR must acquire a sense of morality, and therefore of responsibility. The moral integrity is the soul of any business organization although on its own it is not suffi-

2 Author's translation.

ciently persuasive, exemplary or dissuasive to solve all the eventualities that may afflict the organization. The flexible nature of certain business environments breeds what Román (2004) calls «corrosion of character». The company must respond to the needs and expectations that society demands of it, which include a non-invasive reputation based on concepts of solidarity, sensitivity, ethical policies, responsibility, social image and what is more important, legality, acquiring a new socializing role of support.

Companies are active subjects of global governance (Risse, 2002; Wolft, 2005). Hence, CSR policies must be deployed where there are credible laws with the capacity to be claimed and exercised without subterfuge –legal responsibility– as well as through their awareness, through actions such as charity, philanthropy, social purposes or moral responsibility of companies. Although these actions are always desirable, they are never mandatory, since they are always at the discretion of the company's owners or its managers. An increasing number of pressure groups are working to monitor a natural environment that remains in a clear position of weakness, and are managing to turn their social pressure into a norm adopted by companies. In fact, through their actions and tastes, consumers favor companies committed to the environment (Gildia, 1995, Zaman et al., 1996). Consumers' behavior «[...] can be socially valuable because it helps to discipline the social behavior of companies. However, for consumer pressure to be effective, they must have access to reliable measures of companies' social behavior» (Calveras and Ganuza, 2004: 4).

CSR should be analyzed within the value chain, how it has changed the relationship among suppliers, subcontractors and distributors, as well as the relationship the continuously shifting new industrial paradigm has with the processes of globalization. It is important to know how the company ensures its products meet production and outsourcing standards, involving the whole organization to the point of making it sustainable, avoiding possible divisions/conflicts between the conditions in which a product is designed and the conditions in which it is produced, with special attention to its environment, generating in turn new questions, if, indeed, it does these things. As Grzybowski points out:

Turning the world economic system into a mode of production that is more respectful toward the environment would of course provide enormous long-term economic benefits. But in the short term, it would require considerable investment to overhaul the structures

of production, transport and energy supply, which would slow down the process of lifting millions of individuals out of poverty (2012: 118).

As a solution, this reconversion is met with few favorable tendencies by shareholders (companies) and markets, which in general have more short-term outlooks. Watson¹ (2015), a renowned international expert on molecular biology and toxicology at the University of Texas, is frank in his observations: «It is sad to say that I do not trust motivations of many of these industries [textiles, foodstuffs] whose baseline is to create a line of profits for their shareholders, that is their only concern». There is a patent need to analyze the environment –political, legal, location, NGOs, diplomatic, cultural, migratory, climatic, energy– when carrying out global business in the textile sector, which is the reason for the present study of this sector through its weaknesses.

Our purpose in this study is to respond to the conditions under which management and production of textiles takes place in the framework of developing countries, and the effects this activity has, together with its relation of forces with other countries and hegemonic constraints. We aim to detect the main weaknesses of the textile sector, in relation to corporate social responsibility, and to propose procedures that will help to overcome them. To this end, we analyze responses received from 55 prestigious experts to a set of open questions which we use to stimulate our own ideas and qualitatively explore the multidisciplinary knowledge and privileged views of participants within each of their individual areas of knowledge and expertise.

2. METHODOLOGY

Analysis is required from all angles, including empirical sources, of the existing protocols, current work methodology, and international risks and trends of industrial development associated with the elimination of borders resulting from the globalization processes. To this end, we consider the standard method proposed by EIRMA³ (European Industrial Research

3 The aim of the European Industrial Research Management Association (EIRMA) is to help companies to improve the management and organization of their innovation and R&D activities. A non-profit organization, it was set up in 1966 through a joint initiative of European industry and the OECD (Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development), and is dedicated to promoting the open exchange of experience among renowned professionals.

Management Association) together with expert interviews to be an appropriate method of analysis in this endeavor.

This project applied two research techniques that combine the qualitative perspective: (i) the interview, and (ii) the Delphi technique, following Ruiz Olabuénaga and Ispizua (1989) and Rincón et al. (1995), carried out with two panels of multidisciplinary experts.

2.1. Interview

The interview, which in this case was conducted in writing, provided a detailed picture of the participants' points of view and was summarized in an analysis of weaknesses (Strauss and Corbin, 1990).

The combination of new explanatory models generated and made available to civil and commercial society cannot be carried out with the same tools and interconnections currently used by agents involved in textile processes. A cross-cutting methodology is therefore necessary that brings together agents who are separated by distance or unconnected because their immediate fields of action do not coincide.

Dysfunction must be assessed globally and common solutions provided for multidisciplinary circumstances. To achieve appropriate solutions, problems –and factors– must be clearly identified, bearing in mind that any weakness in the value chain and related circles surrounding the entire textile pyramid make the system more vulnerable.

The solutions sought will be unfolded in a new framework for industrial development, in which all parties can benefit from a fruitful relationship, by fulfilling the demands for human dignity and for control of the agents involved in the activity. We embrace new research methods that have the capacity to innovate, that encourage the development of new theories and question many of the current models, and that bring different perspectives to a set of circumstances, including areas of uncertainty or where empirical evidence is unavailable (Arias, 2003; Pill, 1971).

2.2. Delphi

The Delphi method is a prospective procedure designed to gather information through the participation of a group of experts, based on the discussion of a defined problem. It is a method of structuring a group communication process that allows a group of individuals, as a whole, to address a complex problem in an effective way (Linstone and Turoff, 1995). Mengual (2011) states that an individual tends to be less reliable than a homogeneous group of people on equal terms, and according to Vélez Pareja (2002), this method is appropriate for studying topics where there is no obvious way to gather information referring to both past and future. The Delphi method is, therefore, ideal for obtaining information where these circumstances occur.

Unlike other qualitative techniques such as focus groups or nominal groups, the Delphi technique gathers information and opinions from people who are physically separated, and enables ideas to be generated from open answers, in a well-structured way and with an additional qualitative component (Lunas Huertas et al., 2006).

The output generated by a group is greater than the information even its most experienced and prepared participant can provide, and the number of factors and conditions assessed by a group is greater than any one person could evaluate individually.

For the procedure to be successful, several conditioning factors must coincide, such as preparing the questionnaire, and carefully selecting the experts who will respond to it. This process should be accompanied by successive rounds of contact taking into account the complexity entailed by the participation of experts in different languages and time zones.

2.3. Process

Having identified the research problem, we opted to use a broad panel of participants from different areas of expertise in an attempt to cover all aspects of the hypothesis and explore the topic in greater depth. Existing publications were used, paying particular attention to the focus of our analysis and how to carry it out, not only qualitatively, but also considering the source of information. For example, the response from an organization's press department will differ from the direct opinion of a financially

independent expert or an accredited professional; in many cases, responses are predetermined, especially in large companies that provide identical answers to different problems.

The preparation of the questions was decisive, and considered the way they might influence each another and the forces of logic that could modify the gradation of their answers. The various threads of analysis were taken into account in the structure and specification of the questions –direct, indirect, research related, specific, key, etc.– to reflect the objectives, hypotheses and questions of the research in the questionnaire (Valles, 2014), and relating them to the factors that are necessary to articulate the international textile production systems. The questionnaires were then sent to the participants.

Martínez Piñeiro (2003:452) describes how the researcher draws up the second questionnaire from the replies received, often from closed answers that allow group responses to be treated statistically. Another round of questionnaires and additional information can be sent out if necessary, although this may not be required if a broad degree of consensus is obtained or when it is observed that the consensus has reached its maximum limit, as noted by Fernández-Ballesteros (1995). No specific number of consultations was established prior to the process.

2.4. Questionnaire model

The questionnaire was used to gather the qualitative information on the object of this research. Information was obtained through open questions in order to explore each panelist's point of view about the textile sector and its weaknesses through different lenses and areas of knowledge. One of the challenges was to avoid apathy or indirect stress among the invited experts, since even though the most of them were receptive when the project was proposed, many had previously warned us of their lack of time due to busy agendas. This obliged us to explore the limits of the method until we found a balance that was more aligned with our study and its needs.

The first of the questionnaires consisted of 15 open questions and was sent to experts in the fields of CSR, globalization, corruption, corporate awareness, workers protection, risks, consumer drive, NGOs, among others, presented in a written interview model, based on the literature and on

personal interviews with other experts and non-participating professionals. The second of the questionnaires contained 11 open questions addressed to experts in chemical risks, toxic materials, evaluation agencies, textile dyes, and so on, with the exception of four questions that both panels were asked to respond to.

After the first round of questionnaires had been sent and received, between May 1 and July 30 in 2015 –with some unplanned but predictable delay– we qualitatively analyzed the responses from experts in CSR, legislation, globalization and collective representation of workers to the 15 open questions, and to the 11 open questions from experts in chemistry and risks. This process was followed by a SWOT analysis on the reflections gathered from them, which revealed the weaknesses, with the aim of obtaining a reliable group opinion from the group of experts (Landeta Rodríguez, 2002: 39).

3. RESULTS

After the two rounds of data submission and collection, we decided to use only data from the 55 questionnaires received in the first round, compared to just 12 in the second phase, which varied only slightly from the initial position. In the procedure, the experts were informed that if no responses were obtained in the second and any successive rounds, their initial assessments would hold. The data received from the open responses were qualitatively analyzed. Below, we present an analysis of the weaknesses to provide an overview of the international textile sector. All the positions of the participating experts were analyzed.

3.1. Qualitative results: weaknesses

The weaknesses identified during the consultation as the most relevant in the textile sector were grouped into four main blocks --political and legal, economic, social, and technological weaknesses (PEST)-- to gather the main features and aspects of the textile environment transversally and to optimize understanding for the reader.

Political and legal	Economic
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Existing regulations that are breached (ILO). Weak international mechanisms and lack of judicial control to ensure compliance. At the local level, less judicial capacity in underdeveloped or developing countries. • Absence of international courts to penalize companies for breaches in the value chain; in addition these courts are subject to interests of lobbies and TCs. • The hypothetical creation of an International Court for the TC would be effective if standards and penalties were unified. In the current international landscape, this is highly unlikely due to the conflictive interests of powerful countries, biases, influences, operability problems, as well as immeasurable workload. As a note, what happens with countries like Germany that do not recognize corporate crime? ▪ Difficulty in assigning to TCs health costs attributable to chemical substances used in their products and processes that can be harmful to health. Powerful lobbies will not allow generalized accusations in relation to the costs caused by the toxicity of their products –direct exposure considered as inadvertent use– and undertake long and costly judicial processes. ▪ Non-payment of fair and dissuasive damages for harm caused by TCs' breaches of basic occupational safety standards. ▪ Lack of democracy and international protection for organizations and individuals who are fighting for basic freedoms and rights in textile producing countries. ▪ Former colonial metropolises need corruption in their former colonies to ensure economic and military presence in the area, which requires the safeguarding of the TCs' businesses. ▪ Legal/real permissiveness, depending on each country and context, is nourished with euros/dollars for political campaigns or to line the pockets of public managers. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ In some countries, it is common practice to offer technology and basic infrastructure investment –roads, bridges, railway lines– in exchange for natural resources –for example, the role of China in Africa. Consumption, society and organizations may not have greater capacity than that of globalization to balance out these asymmetries. ▪ In many cases, monopsonic textile companies that buy products –single buyers– exert pressure to lower the selling price of the products, which has an impact on the labor conditions of the local contractor company. ▪ As well as being a business, even the best auditors cannot provide the necessary trade union intervention, particularly at the company or local level, which has given rise to the proposal for international framework agreements. ▪ State capacities need to be enhanced in order to improve control and prevent companies from self-auditing. ▪ The regulations governing the toxicity of certain products are based on outdated scientific findings, in many cases without considering long-term exposure; in fact, some significant chronic negative effects are unlikely to ever be reported. The correction of this situation will take decades. ▪ In certain producing countries there is no minimum wage; it is not a priority for companies, clothing brands and governments. ▪ The occasional and seasonal nature of the work creates greater risks. ▪ The use of CSR as a marketing tool and collective bargaining can further displace unions and states, which are already increasingly less interventionist. CSR is already increasingly less interventionist. CSR in many countries is nothing more than philanthropy, charity and marketing. ▪ Disparity of CSR according to countries / interests.

Social	Technological
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Textile production is a fundamental activity in many countries, with the result that they frequently bow to the demands of their customers by offering lower investment barriers, greater deregulation, greater flexibility, and permissive environmental legislation. • Labor and working conditions are inferior to those in advanced countries. Workers' demands/protests are repressed in many ways, and working days can be up to 14 hours long. • Women's jobs are more precarious than men's. • Global unionism is absent by act or omission. Some governments are pro-business. Companies have advanced in strategies –discrediting, legislative infiltration– to weaken independent unionism. • Online consumer tools focus on boycotting rather than empowering the most responsible companies. Neither do they give them the opportunity to evaluate their supply chains, but focus on, for example, substances/emissions or closed lists of values. • The end of the Multifiber Arrangement eliminated restrictions on production and importing of goods from underdeveloped countries, did not rebalance/harmonize labor, social and environmental aspects, and has led to social dumping. • Fabric of society and of uncontrollable textile production chain in underdeveloped or developing countries with a broad subcontracting chain –including home workshops– and suppliers ranging from very large to small local traders. • Consumer society depends on the mass media, which in turn are controlled by economic power. The media not only fail to challenge global consumption of “branded” goods, but largely profit from them through advertising revenue. They can also cover up irresponsible behavior. • Poor living conditions for workers, low quality accommodation, communal facilities and lack of social/leisure activities. • It costs corrupt companies less to operate under these procedures than to fulfill their legal obligations. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Labeling of garments must be 100% reliable, accessible and understandable, not necessarily in the garment itself, which may contain hundreds of products, but the full list of components, suppliers and processes involved in their production should be published online. • European legislation does not require textile garment labels to include any of the 160 substances from the REACH list; consumers are only informed if they inquire. Citizens do not have tools to defend their rights. Technologically advanced countries are in a privileged position in labor globalization processes, which do not help to eliminate social inequalities. • Many independent studies or findings from research groups on toxic substances are rejected because they do not follow GLP criteria, the high cost of which limits such investigation to industry laboratories that can afford to comply with them. • Centers of production cannot or do not want to modernize traditional production methods to new systems where technology plays a major role, either because they lack the money to invest or because of resistance. • The main problem with dyes is environmental, many of which end up in waste water systems, as well as using large amounts of water and auxiliary products in textile processing. Legislation and control are scarce. Responsibilities for use of toxic products can only be attributed to textile companies if the scientific evidence is able to trace the adverse effects they cause. This is difficult and expensive for NGOs to demonstrate, and holds no real interest for industry or governments. • Maximum limits of exposure to harmful chemical substances are not set by multinationals, but by public agencies, and as such may come under political or business pressure. • Technological advances in textile creation and production frequently do not evaluate the risks and after-effects such as depletion of natural resources or new social models.

4. CONCLUSIONS

Society is now demanding information on whether textile products are manufactured not only legally but also responsibly. The situation in today's textile industry has reached a critical and worrying point: it directly affects advanced countries through offshoring, social dumping and so on, as well as developing or underdeveloped countries and the natural environment.

The textile production system must incorporate tools available today and new advances to ensure sustainability and equity.

Companies are necessary: they create wealth, which in some cases⁴ is distributed through taxes, production and research. Companies explore all possible legal and organizational boundaries for various reasons, mainly to save costs but also to avoid stricter legislation or relatively organized trade unions such as those in Europe. Society looks toward the future, embraced by evolutionary and technological processes related at the same time to mass consumption that is frequently unnecessary, particularly in advanced countries. This sentiment has been well articulated by the major brands in their thirst for business, which are capable of generating artificial desires and needs, and in turn can lead to inequalities and twenty-first century slavery in the form of precarious labor based on transient labor relations.

Today borders no longer exist, at least in terms of the free movement of capital. The purpose of this borderless situation is to explore the limits of productivity with a single common denominator: capital and the maximization of profits concentrated behind the processes of asymmetric globalization. Companies enjoy customized rights and obligations: self-certifications, self-imposed regulations, no limits on pollution levels, which may be outsourced; in turn, these rights and obligations are politically reinforced and scientifically evidenced. Managing these irresponsible behaviors has ended up as part of the CSR «hotchpotch»; hence many of the experts consulted shared similar views on responsibility: namely, that companies should be ethical, that corruption, politics and large business elites are interrelated, and that these relations influence the value chain.

The aim of identifying weaknesses in the textile sector is to help the textile industry develop ethically and sustainably. Any business or state abuse, either by act or by omission, can and must be minimized through correctly designed and evaluated CSR policies. Due to its unlimited scope,

⁴ According to Oxfam-Intermón «Families contribute almost 50 times more to public coffers than large companies» (2014).

we focus on our findings in certain specific areas, and propose action lines as possible measures of response and balance.

4.1. Globalization

We are not against globalization per se, but about how and in what conditions it occurs. The term itself seems to suggest a certain sense of equality, globalism, uniformity; however, the current situation in the framework of the textile industry has a more pyramidal structure because of the uneven concentrations of power, rights and benefits in each of its strata. Hence, the term *asymmetric globalization*, is more appropriate; this term denotes the unequal distribution of certain actions of influence –the concentration of benefits, or workers’ and communities’ dependence on the TC– to a greater or lesser extent, by act or by omission, especially in developing countries where monopsonic textile policies are in place. The processes of globalization have allowed businesses to outsource industrial processes, and states to outsource responsibilities; as international legislative action coincides with commercial action of certain business groups, tax, welfare, environmental or trade union regulations may be removed or ignored. This results in a decline of the labor force in advanced countries, which are unable to compete with underdeveloped countries, and also brings about an increase in the supply of an increasingly technical labor force in the underdeveloped countries, although with evident inequalities. These factors are compounded by gamification⁵ processes in which workers are under pressure to work against the clock, and moreover, keeping their job depends on the continuous scrutiny of individual productivity.

There are still no transnational states with sufficient capacity to regulate and control transnational companies. Today, referring to labor and safety legislation is a utopia for many workers and trade unionists. Although the situation could in fact be corrected, most politicians and entrepreneurs have no interest in doing so, since each improvement in the system, although it would imply a small increase to the final cost of garments that would hardly be noticed by the vast majority of consumers, in the end totals millions of euros that no company, government or mafia is willing to lose or give up.

5 Article aimed at «enhancing human capabilities through quantitative evaluation»(Gueguen, 2015).

Society demands binding commitments. A small number of consumers is able to censure malpractice by purchasing from certain companies. This effect is limited and offset by economic, political and even media powers, the latter in many cases forming part of the same club, both through their shares in companies or from advertising revenue they gain from them; today they are a power without a countervailing power, at the service of the textile industry. Globalization now serves just a few powerful sectors of society.

4.2. Companies and suppliers

TCs use productive or legal resources, free trade areas or weak social systems that guarantee high profits; thus having complied with the legislation in the destination countries –enacted to minimum standards– they are then fully at liberty to expand. Moreover, underdeveloped countries are grateful for and keen to welcome investments, embodied in bilateral, free trade or multilateral treaties. Cultural differences or the ties a company has with its subsidiaries no longer matter; wherever there is business opportunity, there they will go, and any setbacks will be overcome in the best possible way. The «best way» that ruling parties, entrepreneurs and some unions have found is known as CSR, although other ways may include sending royal families as ambassadors (Sánchez, 1999, Fernandez, 2013; Esteban Lario, 2014) in order to achieve objectives, and try to solve through gestures what rulers are not able to solve with minimal legislative changes to protect citizens –however remote the places where the industrial activity is carried out– in the same way as they protect trade.

4.3. Ngos and the environment

Non-governmental organizations act as a countervailing force to defend citizens and the environment. Environmental abuse or land seizures by TCs or states are a common occurrence: the simple possession of exploitation permits enables them to impose their procedures as ideology, in many cases without any real or effective control, taking an attitude that may be described as quasi-criminal. At the same time, many companies minimize their responsibility or leave it to providence through extremely expensive systems of expertise and international arbitration that not all the affected

parties can afford. Hence, there is a need to coordinate procedures that regulate the ecological debt⁶ incurred by governments and TCS, together with due prosecution, publication and punishment of environmental crimes, in accordance with the damages caused by their activity. To this end, a comprehensive environmental prevention plan should be urgently drawn up and implemented to keep up with continuously rising production-pollution rates (Naredo, 1999; Descamps, 2015).

A study⁷ points out that the reduction of CO₂ cause of the greenhouse gas effect, is due to the crisis, not the increase in natural gas consumption. Klaus Hubacek, one of the study's authors, identifies a structural change that also reflects the gradual relocation of emissions to China and other developing countries (2015), in other words, rich countries outsource their pollution and manufacture 'dirty' products in other countries like China.

Although the participants generally agreed in their opinions on the value and existence of NGOs (den Hond and de Bakker, 2007; King and Pearce, 2010; Cardona, 2012), they can sometimes prioritize actions with a high media impact rather than substantial transformations and improvements.⁸ This situation must be rectified if NGOs intend to continue as drivers of transparent and much-needed change. In relation to the transparency of all those involved in the textile sector, of whom transparency is demanded, Mulet⁹ points out:

With regard to NGOs, the same approach could be applied since most of them are also multinationals, but much more opaque. For example, how much does a top executive of Greenpeace or Friends of Earth earn? The NGO model needs rethinking, starting from the basis that most are financed solely by public funds, which contradicts their definition. In fact, the problem of NGOs is that many of their campaigns are not based

6 Ecological debt, according to J. Martínez Alier (2004), is the debt countries of the North accumulated in the South for two reasons. First, exports of primary products at very low prices that do not include the environmental damages occurring at the place of extraction and processing, or pollution on a global scale. Second, by the free or very cheap occupation of environmental space --atmosphere, water, land-- for the disposal of waste from production processes.

7 A study by S. Kuishuang et al. published in 2015 by Nature Communications questions the view of many governments and multinationals that the decline greenhouse gas emissions was due to the gradual decarbonization of the energy system. The analysis shows this to be far from reality; rather, the reduction of emissions has been mainly due to the economic recession, while the lower utilization of fossil fuels played a much smaller role.

8 The NGO Animal Equality links clothing firms with farms on which rabbits are ill-treated (Bow, 2015).

9 J. M Mulet and F Oliván (06 of 2015). Own documentation taken from a Delphi analysis/interview with the author by (A. Luque, interviewer) and included in the thesis «Management and control of the value chain within the textile sector in developing countries, to the limits of logistics and outsourcing: Ethics and Aesthetics».

on solving problems, but on seeking media impacts to capture attention and obtain free advertising (2015).

4.4. Trade unionism

Trade unionism and, therefore, methods of collective representation are facing difficult times. On the question of weak labor legislation, Oliván⁹ (2015) states that «trade unions are not able to understand that the bulk of these exploited people are no longer even considered as workers, a condition that also occurs in advanced countries».¹⁰

In underdeveloped or developing countries, the mere mention of unions causes consternation among business owners¹¹ (Maihack, 2014), and needless to say, for many workers it is almost impossible to exercise their rights in such circumstances (Frank, 2015). On the current situation of collective representation, Hernández¹² (2015) states:

The problem is that trade unions have become weak for several reasons: 1) because of the lack of real representation, 2) because they have failed to understand the global changes and the new forms they would have to learn to organize in the context of globalization, and 3) because, in fact, pro-business governments and companies have deliberately advanced strategies –through discrediting, infiltration but also legislation– to weaken independent, authentic unions.

The reason for manufacturing or subcontracting in certain underdeveloped and developing countries is to avoid dealing with trade unions in advanced countries. In this context, therefore, there is little room for any regulatory measure through CSR, at least from the legal and ethical point of view. Labor relations are in the process of being dismantled, encouraged in many cases by the relentless growth in profits, and by increasing work

10 «Scholarships at zero cost at the UN: A young New Zealander unleashed the controversy over the treatment reserved for interns in Geneva» (Constantini, 2015).

11 Textile industry workers in Bangladesh face precarious labor conditions and anti-union tactics by employers, such as aggressions against or dismissals of union organizers. These practices have been denounced by Human Rights Watch in a 78-page report of 2015 entitled «Whoever Raises Their Head, Suffers the Most: Workers Rights in Bangladesh's Garment Factories», despite the ILO's (2013) efforts to lay the foundations for «Improving working conditions in the ready-made garment sector», and the creation of a joint fund through coordinating committee of major stakeholders following the Rana Plaza disaster in Bangladesh (Rana Plaza Arrangement, 2015).

12 A. Hernández, M. Aguirre and A. Orsatti (July, 2015). Own documentation extracted from a Delphi analysis/interviews with authors by (A. Luque, interviewer) and included in the thesis «Management and control of the value chain within the textile sector in developing countries, towards the limits of logistics and outsourcing: Ethics or Aesthetics».

outsourcing processes. According to Aguirre (2015) trade unionism «is moving towards quasi-disappearance due especially to multiple subcontracting. Forms of trade unionism for subcontracted/non-permanent workers operating transnationally need to be found». In some countries, contractual employment relationships are verbal, and as such are quickly articulated and destroyed, as pointed out by scholar and former ambassador of Italy to India and Iran, Toscano:

It seems clear to me that unionism has been defeated in the more developed world, and is practically nonexistent in the less developed countries: in India, 90 per cent of workers are «informal», with no labor contract, nor rights, nor unions (2015).

In relation to international framework agreements (IFAS) as a path for improvement –transnational company agreements signed between multinationals and global trade union federation– Orsatti states:

Compared with the universe of transnational corporations, the extent of the application of such instruments [intergovernmental instruments such as OECD guidelines, the ILO Tripartite Declaration of Principles, the UN's Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights or ethical tribunals in Latin America] is insignificant, without denying that they represent a slight advance in the exploration of forms of social action and diffusion of the topic; there are fewer than 250 «cases» brought under the OECD Guidelines, fewer than 200 framework agreements, and the ILO Declaration has been applied in barely a dozen occasions (2015).

With about 200 international framework agreements (IFAS), if this is the way forward, are they enough? Are their clauses balanced? With regard to trade union organizations, Palazuelos¹³ has this to say:

Unions are necessary and require a deep rethinking of their objectives, structures and functioning; but this rethinking is no less than is due in both government economic policies and international organizations –existing or to be created ex novo– to address the challenges in the world economy (2015).

Today's unions are in many cases sterile organizations, without the capacity for action/reaction since are neither familiar with or do not have the necessary tools to drive change toward improvements for workers, not only in the textile sector. Examples of ways they could become more effective would be to stop hiding behind certain political parties and compa-

¹³ E. Palazuelos and A. Teitelbaum (07 of 2015). Own documentation extracted from a Delphi analysis/ interviewed by the authors (A. Luque, interviewer) and included in the thesis «Management and control of chain of value within the textile sector in developing countries, towards the limits of logistics and outsourcing: Ethics or Aesthetics».

nies in exchange for perks, or publishing their salaries, duties and functions, etc. According to Teitelbaum:

Trade unionism in general has long given up promoting radical changes that lead to the suppression of capitalist exploitation and limits itself to demanding improvements, which are often not long-lasting. This is aggravated by the lack of international solidarity between workers in developed countries and those in poor countries, because they are in a situation of objective competition due to profound disparities in salaries, despite similar productivity (2015).

4.5. Legislation

Legislation must be a structural element on which other series of actions pivot in coexistence with it (Sebastio, 2014). In fact, when national and international legislation is firmly established, legal security is strengthened and indirect abuse prevented¹⁴ (Chakravarthi, 2004). This is not the case in important normative textile contexts in underdeveloped countries or developing countries, such as Bangladesh or Myanmar, according to Human Rights Watch (2015). Drawing up «tailor-made» regulations with practically no conditions or limits is not legal, although the possibility still exists in some places (Tokman, 2001). It is under these conditions that TCS seek refuge in order to continue producing in situations of manifest social injustice (Ryder, 2015). In this way, they have access to a broad «à la carte» workforce, sometimes in connivance with states that are directly pressurized to look the other way when questions of labor rights or ILO agreement approval are raised. Legislating, or not legislating (Sánchez Barrilao, 2004), these states turn a blind eye to investments which in certain cases will benefit many of their own rulers-owners, as was the case in Bangladesh's Rana Plaza (Navarro, 2013).

The level of permissiveness of the executive, legislative or judicial powers towards the way chemical or textile multinational, transnational companies act is such, according to Beck (1998) and Zabalo (2006), that they end up transferring this illegitimate legitimacy to companies, transforming them into semi-states (Beck, 2000), in many cases with their own corporate governance and contacts at the highest level among high ranking managers, or presidents and prime ministers of these countries.¹⁵ Profit maximization

¹⁴ Oxfam Intermon Report, «Fiscal illusion: too many shadows in the taxation of large companies» (2015).

¹⁵ «Pablo Isla doesn't give anything for nothing in China: Inditex CEO meets members of the Asian giant's government in his visit to a key market for the company» (Vázquez, 2015).

zation, as an idea, is the current norm. Therefore, any legal non-limitation of the market is welcomed, as Ramonet (2009) and Gotzsche (2014) have noted. Such is the case of lobbies and corporations that subject the EU and certain governments to individual interests (Brown, 1998; Folch, 1998; Kwame Sundaram, 2009).

4.6. Chemical hazards and toxicity

The safety measures and controls applied to the textile sector are now more robust and modern than they have ever been (Aular, 2013). Many of the participants were inclined to state that this is a political problem, not a scientific one.

It should be noted that many of the current rules regulating which chemicals can be used in textile manufacturing processes are in fact outdated, as affirmed in some of the studies referenced in this article. Updating procedures should be enhanced, as this is the way to improve investment in science as well as ensuring greater transparency. There is little integration of scientific evidence on the toxicity of compounds:

Current standards are based on fairly old scientific findings. Many of those toxicology studies were outdated tests that simply indicated if an animal exposed to a chemical died immediately or at least soon after. This does not take into account the long-term health and quality of life of animals exposed to them. In fact, there are likely to be significant negative chronic effects that will never be picked up by toxicology –survival– tests on rodents (Watson,¹⁶ 2015).

Endocrine disruptors¹⁷ are one such compound. They must be identified correctly and studied, and notable research in this field has been done by Fernández, Olmos, and Olea (2007), Olea, (2009), and Repetto and Repetto (2009). As Romano, an expert in the area, points out:

The effects of bio-accumulative toxicants are of particular concern as they are not metabolized or do so very slowly, which means their toxic effects can persist over a longer

16 C. S. Watson and D. Romano, (07 of 2015). Own documentation extracted from a Delphi analysis/interview with the author (A. Luque, interviewer) and included in the thesis «Management and control of chain of value within the textile sector in developing countries, towards the limits of logistics and outsourcing: Ethics or Aesthetics».

17 «The effects of ED [endocrine disruptors] occur at very low doses, usually far below legally established exposure limits. We are exposed to ED in our workplaces, but also in our homes through contaminating pesticides, exposure to plastic products and plasticizers, the use of some detergents and environmental pollution» (Aular, 2013).

period. In addition, accumulation of these toxicants in food-source animals can lead to their exposure in the population (2015).

Most of the experts consulted agree that more thorough studies, better methods of analysis, and information can reduce health costs as well as risks to people. Scientific advances in the textile industry largely due to chemical innovation must not be considered as scientific collateral damage, but should be subject to maximum transparency based on expert recommendations, under the assumption that the academic bodies regulating the use of certain substances do not guarantee their reliability. There is consensus on the need to ensure consumers have the right to information on all compounds found in textile garments. It is technically possible to include a code on the label that can be consulted on Internet, the consumers' right to this information overriding any alleged industrial secrecy.

In the view of the experts, the way to improve consumer safety and lower risks to workers would be to establish multi-sector strategies –to reduce exposure and minimize the risk of certain substances– advancing in the development of criteria and standards to protect the health of workers and the general population, and preventing the use of more hazardous substances in countries with weaker legislation. In researcher study, Chemicals in textiles: A potential source of exposure for humans and environmental contamination Luongo states that «[...] organic cotton and ecological labeling are no guarantee that textiles are free of harmful chemicals» (2015: 37).

4.7. Impact studies

Real appropriate language should be used in impact studies, without any concealment of the facts by the agents involved. When a risk emerges institutional or company denial cannot be grounded on the argument that impact studies were not carried out with representative samples when many of the components used¹⁸ are unknown. Chemical and occupational hazards¹⁹ exist, despite not being recognized by certain public bodies or

18 The journal Environmental Health Perspectives (2015), known as the «Madrid Declaration», in which more than 200 scientists show their concern for the chemical compounds per and polyfluorides. This document highlights the scant information manufacturers on the structures and toxicological profiles of the PFCs present in the market.

19 «Chemicals in textiles: Risks to human health and the environment» (KEMI Swedish Chemicals Agency, 2014).

companies (Martí Valls, 2011). Business organizations do not invest in or facilitate actions that will negatively affect their profits, and in fact will promote studies that favor their interests.²⁰ States have become too large to deal with small issues, and too small to tackle large problems, and as a result lack authority –and often legitimacy– as their responsibilities have been transferred to defective supranational bodies, losing their sovereignty in the process (Bodemer, 1998, Rodríguez, 1999). By way of example, research by the University of Granada and the Centre for Research in Environmental Epidemiology (CREAL) provides clear evidence of the risks of certain chemical substances. These risks should not be ignored simply because they were published by valid, rigorous systems that are not recognized by TCs, or by institutions with fewer resources. Indeed, these organizations have fewer material and human resources not because the research community wishes this to be the case, but rather, in many cases, due to the pressure to protect the interests of those who might be affected by the results of such studies.

4.8. Unemployment, human and social rights

The level of unemployment and the outsourcing and/or subcontracting of textile services condition the new economic and social paradigm. Companies can now make record profits, while at the same time cutting the number of employees and implementing minimum working conditions. A structure of thousands of workers can now be created with a single computer, capital, internet connection and little else; the rest is provided by the market. There are more risks associated with this situation today than ever before; not only is capital accumulated by a very small part of the world population, but capital generates more capital without the need for a workforce, which is regarded by most people as a casino economy (Navarro et al., 2011, Navarro, 2015). The competitive advantage enjoyed by such systems is immense, especially when the whole picture is taken into

20 A study sponsored by the National Textile Center (Wang et al., 2002) through eight universities of North Carolina investigated the thermal stability of textiles, specifically with respect to the antioxidants used in the finishes. Four antioxidants were investigated, one of which is based on bisphenol A. According to Oecotextiles (2011) bisphenol A is used in the production of flame retardants, and as an intermediary in the manufacture of polymers, fungicides, antioxidants, and dyes. Due to its use as an intermediate product, it is difficult to be precise, textile manufacturers also keep their components secret; thus it will not be possible to know its actual composition unless financing is provided for a study.

account --an image that has been assiduously presented by many business schools. The overall transversal panorama of the textile sector gives rise to many uncertainties. There is a patent need for ethical and economic analysis of whether companies should be able to use an «à la carte» laborforce, and take advantage of subsidies or state bonuses for their objectives while at the same time outsourcing costs.

Companies should be responsible and carry out their activities with the same respect and ethical conditions –and if possible the same materials– as the so-called first world, internalizing their values *per se* and those that society expects of them. The situations of unethical exploitation by TCS and governments must be recognized, denounced, persecuted and punished.

4.9. CSR

CSR in the textile sector –like many other non-mandatory recommendations with no requirements– seeks to improve business practices as well as company relations with all its stakeholders, in order to obtain tangible results that contribute to general social improvement. This idea, supported for example by the UN's Guiding Principles, among others, neither pursues nor imposes binding agreements; nor does it limit the responsibility of TCS to their own territories, nor does it provide real and effective judicial responsibility over the supply chain or other mechanisms deployed in relation to human rights. TCS seek to generate a positive impact at a minimum cost, and also attempt to reconvert it as an investment. Companies will always strive to maintain control over these costs, rather than have them imposed by society through the law. On this point, they behave as though they dictate the extent of the law and the loopholes it contains, by contravening the rules and then pardoning themselves or prescribing their own sanctions, at their own convenience. It should not be forgotten that although «companies» refer to formal institutions, that their decisions, behaviors and benefits are ultimately taken, enacted and enjoyed by specific individuals.

Companies fail to do everything within their means to integrate or to learn about the culture in the countries where they carry out their industrial activity; in fact they abuse their position of strength. Their communication departments do not always behave ethically, but instead make instrumental use of CSR. Large companies, as well as some official bodies have for some years followed the widespread «be friendly» communication strategy, instigated by the social media. In most of the cases this goes no further

than generating a «miracle» through social media: how to convince people that things are changing while everything remains the same, but with *followers* and CSR.

The arguments put forward by certain textile companies, which are debatable and flimsy, coupled with the concealment of information and their gradually increasing empowerment, are far removed from the objectives of CSR, and are indeed counterproductive. Even when questions go unanswered, they do have an answer. The evidence of abuse by companies and institutions in these circumstances is clear, and for their own benefit, or is it possible that if robust legislation were in place, taking into account scientific advances, there would no longer be a need for CSR?

One course of action is to help improve existing legislation -by publishing the means and endeavors of such an action- but it is a different matter to take advantage of the current legislation or that the legislation is so weak as to try to distort CSR to the status of law. The present TC landscape cannot ignore such fundamental precepts as real compliance with and promotion of human rights. We cannot hope to improve aspects affecting fundamental rights through corporate social responsibility, international framework agreements or consumer «power» with the ineffectual instruments available to them.

5. ACTION LINES

The textile industry must combine its commercial purpose and its inescapable social function in a responsible way. In other words, it must carry out its production and pursue profitability in ethical conditions of security, dignity, equality and sustainability, in a way that benefits all parties involved. This aim, more than simply desirable, is possible and must be mandatory. In consequence, and having analyzed the weaknesses identified by the experts in this study, we propose a set of actions that can help to improve the conditions in which TCs operate in a variety of contexts:

- 1) Textiles cannot and should not be produced in countries where human rights²¹ are violated. An excellent predictor of this is the approval of ILO conventions by countries where companies want to produce.

21 The ambassador of Bangladesh, accused of crimes against humanity, submits credentials to the king (Europapress, 2015).

- 2) Establish extraterritorial joint and several liability for its suppliers, subsidiaries, subcontractors, licensees as well as all manner of legal tracts²² that related by action or omission with the products and/or services produced.
- 3) Linking of bilateral, multilateral, free trade and other agreements treaties to public judges and courts in order to generate transparency, certainty and equity without undermining state sovereignty.
- 4) Stated and corporations must take responsibility where TCS fail to maintain diligence. Public authorities have the obligation to prevent, investigate and punish. States cannot be free of responsibilities in the context of a market with failings and no effective regulation (Tirole, 2005).
- 5) Audits may be necessary if they are regulated by the public authorities. Experience has revealed their surrounding business activities and in many cases, their debatable effectiveness.
- 6) Establishment of protocols with sanctioning capacity to protect the environment and all living beings. An international environmental inspection body with the power to sanction and caution may be a useful and relevant means of control at a global level. Sanctions would be published and would be public and global.
- 7) Selection criteria in TCS based on moral rectitude, ethics and values, not only in professional-economic²³ capacities.
- 8) (De)rating agencies can be used positively, although they can equally highlight negative aspects, according to Pereyra (2013).²⁴ Their dependence on private bodies, usually through foundations, patronages, or companies with specific interests, means that their evaluation of the information they gather is far removed from the principles of solidarity and objectivity. The lack of detail in all rating agencies' revenues, which they claim to be transparent, or the way they are financed, makes them *de facto* the very opposite of trans-

22 «Inditex has derived at least 2,000 million dollars in profits from a small operating unit in the Netherlands and Switzerland. This company employs only 0.1% of Inditex's global workforce, but published at least 20% of the parent company's profits in the previous year» (Drucker, 2014).

23 The head of Google's Human Resources in an interview with the New York Times notes, «The academic record is useless» (Bryant, 2013).

24 «One of the best known measurement tools is the Corruption Perceptions Index (CPI) prepared by Transparency International, which allows classifying in a ranking almost two hundred countries. In addition to inducing confusion between perception and measurement, the index has been questioned because it relies centrally on financial consultants to carry out evaluations, which generates a strong bias that reflects what we might call generically the world view of business. According to this measurement, in 2012, Argentina ranked 102th, while Chile, to take a close example, is positioned in 20th place. Is Argentina a much more corrupt country than Chile? [...]» (Pereyra, 2013).

parent. We therefore propose a rating agency under the auspices of public bodies from a wide range of sectors with no direct economic interests, with the objective capacity to guarantee clarity, will and efforts by the (supranational) assessment agency in relation to the ratings for transparency, security and suitability of the countries analyzed, as well as compliance with and respect for the human rights of the affected parties.

- 9) The language used by companies in reporting events such as human catastrophes or major contamination must accurately, clearly and appropriately reflect an intention to inform civil society, providing appropriate dissemination of information in proportion to the situation and its scope, so as not to become doubly co-responsible.
- 10) International framework agreements (IFAs) may or may not democratize industrial relations in global production chains. They can be used as screens in the form of corporate instruments, demonizing labor relations because they lack any punitive content, effective supervision and the means to put them into practice in a meaningful, independent and proportional way without corporate dependency. Whether or not cases through the entire production chain are included remains inexcusably at the discretion of quasi private and asymmetric negotiation. An annual contribution is proposed to ensure economic and corporate independence of the agents involved, proportionate to the object covered with mechanisms of revocability, denunciation, supervision and autonomous management. The ILO should authorize and monitor its establishment, not be a mere observer.
- 11) Presentation of corporate affiliation of the production chain and subcontracting information to the competent authorities; this custodial body would be duly protected and would maintain the information in secrecy, subject to penalty in case of non-compliance.
- 12) All products contained in the garments and the suppliers of those products must be included on the garments' labels. Mechanisms are available that would provide consumers with access, through a simple QR code on the label, to information on Internet listing the garments' components, the number of sanctions against the company and the reasons for them, and the entire production chain. Codes could be used instead of names, since the name of the subcontracted company or workshop is not what the consumer should

know, but this system would provide wholly reliable information on matters of prevention, conciliation, human rights, sanctions, etc.

- 13) The penalties for non-compliant textile companies should clearly state that they will be prevented from supplying products to public administrations. By way of example, not recognizing or hindering the rights of homosexuals and people with disabilities, or excluding pregnant women,²⁵ which are sensitive issues in fragile countries, should be addressed through pedagogical measures with due monitoring of corrective actions, including termination of commercial links, should be previously specified in the conditions with due compensation to the administration and society for the harm caused.
- 14) Increased competencies on TCS for the International Criminal Court (ICC). Limitation of the legal mechanisms by TCS, such as limiting ICC competencies, establishing jurisdiction only on natural, not legal, persons, and for economic offenses, or preventing binding links with ILO resolutions generates a justice system with no substance.
- 15) Workers must receive a decent wage, established in accordance with objective parameters by international public bodies, not recommendations.
- 16) Democratization of international organizations. A system of 'one country, one vote' should be implemented to prevent abuses by countries with greater economic strength, as is currently the case in the World Bank or IMF where votes are proportional to financial contributions,²⁶ with the resulting situation in which some countries are permanently subjugated, and normative asymmetries are legally legitimized.
- 17) Control of debt in poor countries. Credit cannot be authorized -in many cases through stability plans- in the knowledge that they can never be repaid, generating extortionate fees, irreparable damage and a debt indirectly designed to be unrecoverable.
- 18) Control of ruthless competition between countries in the production system. Competition with extremely different economies

25 «We visited four factories, two producing clothes and two footwear, one from each sector in the two industrial zones visited: Ho Chi Minh City (formerly Saigon) and Hanoi-Haiphong. The number of workers per factory ranged between 1,000 and 8,000 (one of the footwear factories), with women accounting for around 85% of the total» (Boix and Garrido, 2015: 11).

26 The role of International Organizations in contemporary issues: a study on the World Bank and its position on poverty (Carcedo and Calvento, 2014).

would be prevented by establishing «social gates» that could neutralize social dumping.

- 19) Effective regulation of collaborative economies as a socializing element, for managing economic crises and R&D&I. Regulation in favor of large corporations²⁷ prohibits self-consumption, prevents the sharing of services, or creates all manner of barriers for small textile producers, which have no way of competing with large TCS. These practices must be corrected and rebalanced to prevent part of society from falling into greater social risk, since the collaborative economy is the only way for many peoples and classes of society to make a living.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Arias, M. (2003). *Metodologías de investigación emergentes en economía de la empresa*. Bordeaux, Papers Proceedings 2003, XVII Congreso Nacional XIII congreso hispano-francés AEDEM, Université Montesquieu Bordeaux IV.
- Aular, Y. (2013). *Disruptores endocrinos: un nuevo informe con recomendaciones para reducir sus efectos adversos a la salud*. Valencia (Venezuela): Salus V.17 N°1.
- Beck, U. (1998). *¿Qué es la globalización? Falacias del globalismo, respuestas a la globalización*. Paidós Estado y Sociedad.
- Beck, U. (2000). *Un nuevo mundo feliz. La precariedad del trabajo en la era de la globalización*. Barcelona: Paidós.
- Bodemer, K. (1998). La globalización. Un concepto y sus problemas. *Nueva sociedad*, N°156, 54-71.
- Brown, L. (1998). *El futuro del crecimiento*. Barcelona: En The Worldwatch Institute, La situación del mundo 1998. Icaria.
- Buxmann, P. (1999). *Evaluating the Use of Information Technology in Interorganizational relationships*. Hawaii Conference on Systems Sciences. Maus.
- Calveras, A., & Ganuza, J. (2004). *Responsabilidad Social Corporativa. Una Visión desde la Teoría Económica*. Barcelona.

²⁷ The car manufacturers' lobby forcefully establishes itself in the EU when legislation is being modified (Riés, 2016).

- Cardona, H. (2012). Cardona, H. A. M. (2012). Innovación y responsabilidad social: una reflexión sobre los puntos de encuentro. *Revista Universidad & Empresa*, 13(21), 13-35.
- Chakravarthi, R. (2004). *Globalización y movimientos migratorios*. Alternativas Sur, V.3, N°1.
- Christopher, M., Peck, H., & Towill, D. (2006). A taxonomy for selecting global supply chains strategies. *The International Journal of Logistics Management*, V.17, issue. 2, 277-287.
- Del Rincón, D., Arnal, J., Latorre, A., & Sans, A. E. (1995). *Técnicas de investigación en Ciencias Sociales*. Madrid: Dickinson.
- Den Hond, F., & de Bakker, F. (2007). Ideologically Motivated Activism: How Activist Groups Influence Corporate Social Change Activities. 901-924.
- Descamps, P. (2015). De la ciencia a la política. *Le Monde Diplomatique*, N°241, 13.
- Echezarraga, J., & Jarillo, J. C. (2001). *Estrategia Internacional más allá de la Exportación*. McGraw-Hill.
- Esteban Lario, J. (2014). *Comunicación y Protocolo Empresarial en los países de la zona euro*. Dykinson.
- Fernández, F. (2013). El «tabú» periodístico de la monarquía en España. La crisis real y la crisis coyuntural. *revista Latina de Comunicación Social*. N° 68.
- Fernández, M., Olmos, B., & Olea, N. (2007). Exposure to endocrine disruptors and male urogenital tract malformations [cryptorchidism and hypospadias]. *Gaceta Sanitaria*, 21(6), 500-514.
- Fernández-Ballesteros, R. (1995). *Evaluación de programas: una guía práctica en ámbitos sociales, educativos y de salud*. Madrid: Síntesis.
- Folch, R. (1998). *Ambiente, emoción y ética*. Barcelona: Ed. Ariel.
- Gil, I., Mollá, A., & Ruiz, M. (2008). Automatización del almacén y surtido en la distribución de productos de uso duradero. *Universia Business Review*. Tercer Trimestre, 118-133.
- Gildia, R. (1995). Consumer survey confirms corporate social responsibility affects buying decisions. *Public Relations Quarterly*, n° 39, 20-21.
- Grzybowski, L. (2012). ¿Perjudica la mundialización al medio ambiente? (M. Sfeir, Ed.) *El Atlas de las Mundializaciones*, 118.
- Guercini, S., & Runfola, A. (2004). Guercini, S. and A. Runfola (2004), «Sourcing strategies in clothing retail firms: product complexity versus overseas supply chain. *Journal of Costumer Behaviour*, V.3, issue 3, 305-334.

- Hess, M., & Yeung, H. (2006). Whither global production networks in economic geography? Past, present, and future. *Environment and Planning A*, V.38, issue. 7, 1193-1204.
- Heuskel, & Costa. (1999). Estrategia en la era de la desintegración. *Harvard Deusto Business Review*, Nov, 36-45.
- Jiménez, M., & Kuhn, G. (2009). *Toxicología fundamental*. Ediciones Diaz de Santos.
- Jódar. (1998). Impacto de las TIC en el sector textil-confección. *Informe del Observatorio Industrial del sector Textil-Confección*.
- Kahhat, F. (2005). *El tema de la corrupción en la literatura en ciencia política*. En Felipe Portocarrero.
- King, B., & Pearce, N. (2010). The Contentiousness of Markets: Politics, Social Movements, and Institutional Change in Markets. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 36, 249-267.
- Kwame Sundaram, J. (2009). *El rol del sector privado en la lucha contra la corrupción: su importancia para afrontar los desafíos locales y mundiales en materia de gobernabilidad*. Informe Global de la Corrupción 2009: Corrupción y sector privat. Cambridge University Press.
- Landeta Rodríguez, J. (2002). *The Delphi method. A forecasting technique for the future*. Ariel.
- Linstone, H., & Turoff, M. (1975). *The Delphi method: Techniques and applications*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley. V.29.
- Luna Huertas, P., Infante Moro, A., & Martínez, F. (2006). Los Delphi como fundamento metodológico predictivo para la investigación en sistemas de información y tecnologías de la información (Is/It). *Pixel-Bit. Revista de Medios y Educación* N° 26, 89-112.
- Martí Valls, J. (2011). *La contaminación y la salud*. Centre d'Anàlisi i Programes Sanitaris (CAPS).
- Martínez Piñeiro, E. (2003). The Delphi technique as a strategy for consulting those involved in the evaluation of programs. *Revista de Investigación Educativa*, V.21, N°2, 449-463.
- Mengual, S. (2011). *La importancia percibida por el profesorado y el alumnado sobre la inclusión de la competencia digital en educación Superior*. Alicante: Departamento de Didáctica General y Didácticas específicas de la Facultad de Alicante.
- Naredo, J. (1999). *Desarrollo económico y deterioro ecológico*. Madrid: Visor y Fundación Argentaria.

- Navarro, V., Torres, J., & Garzón, A. (2011). *Hay alternativas: propuestas para crear empleo y bienestar social en España*. Sequitur.
- Olea, N. (2009). *Disruptores endocrinos: su presencia en el medio y efectos*. Sociedad Española de Química Analítica (SEQA).
- Pereyra, S. (August, 2013). Estado, transparencia y disputa por el poder: La corrupción como crítica de la política. *Le Monde Diplomatique*.
- Pill, J. (1971). The Delphi method: substance, context, a critique and an annotated bibliography. *Socio-Economic Planning Sciences*. V.5, issue 1, 57-71.
- Prahalad, C., & Hamel, G. (1990). The Core Competence of the Corporation. *Harvard Business Review*, V.68, N° 3, 79-111.
- Ramonet, I. (09 de 2009). Mafias farmacéuticas. *Le Monde Diplomatique*. N°167, 1.
- Riisgaard, L., & Hammer, N. (2011). Prospects for Labour in Global Value Chains: Labour Standards in the Cut Flower and Banana Industries. *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, N°49, 168-190.
- Risse. (2002). *Transnational actors and world politics*. In W. von Carlsnaes, T. Risse & B. Simmons. (Sage, Ed.) Londres: Handbook of international relations.
- Rodríguez, G. (1999). *Derecho internacional y globalización* V.11. Isonomía.
- Román, B. (2004). La corrosión del ethos corporativo: reflexiones sobre las condiciones de posibilidad de la ética empresarial. *Recerca*, N°4, 137-151.
- Ruiz Olabuénaga, J., & Ispizua, M. (1989). *La descodificación de la vida cotidiana*. Bilbao: Universidad de Deusto.
- Sánchez Barrilao, J. (2004). Sobre la constitución normativa y la globalización. *Revista de la Facultad de Derecho de la Universidad de Granada*. N°7, 241-261.
- Sánchez, J. (1999). El coste de la Casa Real en el Siglo XVII. *Cuadernos de Estudios Empresariales*, 87-107.
- Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1990). *Basics of Qualitative Research: Grounded Theory, procedures and techniques*. Sage Publications. Newbury Park, CA.
- The globe and mail (July 6, 2005): «Bell Globomedia Publishing», available in: <http://v1.theglobeandmail.com/servlet/Page/document/travel/travelDestination?goto=Muskoka>
- Tokmann, V. (2012). *Políticas de empleo en la nueva era económica*. Economía, 23(46).
- Valles, M. (2014). *Entrevistas cualitativas*. CIS-Centro de Investigaciones Sociológicas. V.32.

- Vélez Pareja, I. (2002). *Decisiones de inversión enfocado a la valoración de empresas*. Bogotá: CEJA.
- Werner, K., & Weiss, H. (2006). *El libro negro de las marcas*. Buenos Aires: Editorial Sudamericana.
- Wolft, K. (2005). *Private actors and the legitimacy of governance beyond the state: Conceptual outlines and empirical explorations*. Londres: In A. Benz & I. Papadopoulos (Eds.), *Governance and democratic legitimacy*.
- Zabalo, P. (2006). *El papel de las multinacionales en la economía globalizada*. Pueblos. N°5.
- Zaman, M., Yamin, S., & Wong, F. (1996). Environmental consumerism and buying preference for green products. *Proceedings of the Australian Marketing Educators Conference*, 613-626.
- Ziegler, J. (2013). *Destrucción Masiva: Geopolítica del hambre*. Barcelona: Booket (Península).

OTHER SOURCES

- Boix, I. y Garrido, V. (2015): «Vietnam 2015: Una nueva aproximación sindical IV al país, a su sindicalismo y a sus industrias de la confección y del calzado», *Confederación Sindical de Comisiones Obreras*, available in: http://industria.ccoo.es/comunes/recursos/99927/2076991-Informe_-_Vietnam_2015.pdf
- Bow, J. (September 3, 2014): «Igualdad animal vincula a firmas de ropa con granjas que maltratan a conejos», *El País*, available in: http://sociedad.elpais.com/sociedad/2014/09/03/actualidad/1409735825_662861.html
- Bryant, A. (June 19, 2013): «In Head-Hunting, Big Data May Not Be Such a Big Deal», *NYTimes*, available in: <http://www.nytimes.com/2013/06/20/business/in-head-hunting-big-data-may-not-be-such-a-big-deal.html?pagewanted=1&r=1&smid=tw-nytimesbusiness&partner=socialflow>
- Carcedo, J. y Calvento, M. (2014): «El rol de los organismos internacionales en las problemáticas contemporáneas: un estudio sobre el banco mundial y su posicionamiento con respecto a la pobreza», *VII Congreso de Relaciones Internacionales del Instituto de Relaciones Internacionales de la Universidad Nacional de La Plata*, available in: http://sedici.unlp.edu.ar/bitstream/handle/10915/44489/Documento_completo.pdf?sequence=1

- Constantini, L. (August 19, 2015): «Scholarships at zero cost at the UN: A young New Zealander unleashed the controversy over the treatment reserved for interns in Geneva», *El País*, available in: http://internacional.elpais.com/internacional/2015/08/18/actualidad/1439895492_896718.html
- Descamps, P. (2015): «De la ciencia a la política», *Le Monde Diplomatique*, 241, p. 13.
- Drucker, J. (2014): «Ortega's Zara Fashions Tax Avoidance by Shifting Profits to Alps», *Bloomberg*, available in: <http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2014-02-26/ortega-s-zara-fashions-tax-avoidance-by-shifting-profits-to-alps>
- Environmental Health Perspectives (mayo de 2015): «The Madrid Statement on Poly- and Perfluoroalkyl Substances (PFASS)», available in: <http://ehp.niehs.nih.gov/wp-content/uploads/123/5/ehp.1509934.alt.pdf>
- Europapress (2015): « El embajador de Bangladesh, acusado de crímenes de lesa humanidad, presenta credenciales ante el Rey », available in: <http://www.europapress.es/nacional/noticia-embajador-bangladesh-acusado-crimenes-lesa-humanidad-presenta-credenciales-rey-20151216131152.html>
- Frank, T. (04 de enero de 2015): «Chain restaurants are killing us: Billionaire bankers, minimum-wage toilers and the nasty truth about fast-food nation», *Salon*, available in: http://www.salon.com/2015/01/04/chain_restaurants_are_killing_us_billionaire_bankers_minimum_wage_toilers_and_the_nasty_truth_about_fast_food_nation/
- Gotzsche, P. C. (September 12, 2014): «Las farmacéuticas extorsionan a los gobiernos», *La Marea*, available in: <http://www.lamarea.com/2014/09/12/peter-c-gotzsche-las-farmaceuticas-extorsionan-los-gobiernos-con-tecnicas-mafiosas/>
- Guegu en, M. (2015): «Les damnés de l'hyper», *Philosophie Magazine*, available in: <http://www.philomag.com/lepoque/reportage/les-damnes-delhyper-11545>. <http://www.europapress.es/nacional/noticia-embajadorbangladesh-acusado-crimenes-lesa-humanidad-presenta-credencialesrey-20151216153954.html>
- Human Rights Watch (2015): «Whoever Raises Their Head, Suffers the Most': Workers' Rights in Bangladesh's Garment Factories», available in: http://features.hrw.org/features/hrw_2015_reports/Bangladesh_Garment_Factories/index.htm
- International Labour Organization (2013): «Mejorar las condiciones de trabajo en la industria del vestido: Progresos y resultados», available in:

- http://www.ilo.org/global/research/publications/WCMS_229105/lang-es/index.htm
- Kemi Swedish Chemicals Agency (2014): «Chemicals in textiles: Risks to human health and the environment», available in: <https://www.kemi.se/files/8040fb7a4f2547b7bad522c399c0b649/report6-14-chemicals-intextiles.pdf>
- Kuishu ang, S. y otros (July 21, 2015): «Drivers of the us co2 emissions 1997-2013», *Nature Comumunications*, available in: <http://www.nature.com/ncomms/2015/150721/ncomms8714/full/ncomms8714.html>
- Maihack, H. (November 3, 2014): «After Rana Plaza: Bottom Up Not Top Down To Ensure Workers Safety», *Social Europe*, available in <http://www.socialeurope.eu/2014/11/rana-plaza-bottom-top-ensureworkers-safety/>
- Muscati, S. (March 12, 2015): «Camboya: Trabajadores de la industria de la confección están desprotegidos», *Human rights watch*, available in: <http://www.hrw.org/es/news/2015/03/11/camboya-trabajadores-de-la-industria-de-la-confeccion-estan-desprotegidos>
- Naím, M. (October 10, 2015): «El mundo entre comillas: Vivimos en un universo lleno de instituciones y situaciones deliberadamente diseñadas para engañar a los incautos», *El País*, available in: http://internacional.elpais.com/internacional/2015/10/10/actualidad/1444491899_543067.html
- Navarro, V. (January 19, 2015): «El porqué de las desigualdades: una crítica del libro de Thomas Piketty «Capital in the Twenty-First Century»», *Vnavarro.org*, available in: <http://www.vnavarro.org/?p=11701>
- (23 de mayo de 2013): «Lo que no se dice sobre Bangladesh», *Vnavarro.org*, available in: <http://www.vnavarro.org/?p=8939&lang=CA>
- Oecotextiles (2011): «Bisphenol A in textile processing?», available in: <https://oecotextiles.wordpress.com/2011/12/16/bisphenol-a-in-textileprocessing/>
- Oxfam-Intermón (May 28, 2014): «Las familias aportan casi 50 veces más a las arcas públicas que las grandes empresas», available in: <http://www.oxfamintermon.org/es/sala-de-prensa/nota-de-prensa/familias-aponan-casi-50-veces-mas-arcas-publicas-que-grandes-empresas>
- (marzo de 2015): «La ilusión fiscal: demasiadas sombras en la fiscalidad de las grandes», available in: http://www.oxfamintermon.org/es/quehacemos/proyectos/desigualdad/ilusion-fiscal?utm_source=ndp&utm_medium=medios&utm_content=2&utm_campaign=IGuales

- Pereyra, S. (2013): «Estado, transparencia y disputa por el poder: La corrupción como crítica de la política», *Le Monde Diplomatique*, 170.
- Ramonet, I. (2009): «Mafias farmacéuticas», *Le Monde Diplomatique*, 167, p. 1.
- Rana plaza arrangement (2015): «Donors», available in: <http://www.ranaplaza-arrangement.org/fund/donors>
- Riés, P. (January 19, 2016): «Volkswagen, Renault et le TTIP», *Mediapart*, available in: <https://www.mediapart.fr/journal/economie/190116/volkswagen-renault-et-le-ttip>
- Ryder, G. (February 27, 2015): «Labor In The Age Of Robots», *Social Europe*, available in: <http://www.socialeurope.eu/2015/02/labor-inthe-age-of-robots/>
- Sebastio, F. (November 11, 2014): «Industrialisation And Female Empowerment: Evidence From The Bangladeshi Garments Sector», *Social Europe*, available in: <http://www.socialeurope.eu/2014/11/industrialisation-female-empowerment-evidence-bangladeshi-garmentssector/>
- The globe and mail (July 6, 2005): «Bell Globomedia Publishing», available in: <http://v1.theglobeandmail.com/servlet/Page/document/travel/travelDestination?goto=Muskoka>